

28 September 2022

File Ref: OIAP-7-25819

Your Bay Your Say	
By email:	

Tēnā koe

# Request for information 2022-155

I refer to your request for information dated 13 September 2022, which was received by Greater Wellington Regional Council (Greater Wellington) on 13 September 2022. You have requested the following:

- "1. When was 4Sight Consulting Limited acquired by SLR group?
- 2. Will Commissioner Ashby continue to be Chair of the Panel? If not, then who will be subsequent Chair?
- 3. Please provide a copy of the legal advice referred to from Greater Wellington Regional Council legal counsel.
- 4. Please provide a copy of any other legal advice obtained.
- 5. Please provide the decision report that covers how the risk of potential conflict has been/is being managed, and any correspondence and meeting notes subsequent to the decision report. And any other relevant documents.

[6] We note that Council/s have discussed and agreed how to manage the conflict of interest with the applicant. However, it is the submitters who are most at risk of being adversely affected by the conflict. Please advise whether you will be consulting and seeking agreement of submitters."

Additionally, I refer to your further request dated 23 September 2022 which was received by Greater Wellington Regional Council (Greater Wellington) on 23 September 2022. You have requested the following:

Wellington office PO Box 11646 Manners St, Wellington 6142

Upper Hutt PO Box 40847 1056 Fergusson Drive Masterton office PO Box 41 Masterton 5840

0800 496 734 www.gw.govt.nz info@gw.govt.nz 7. Please provide Greater Wellington Regional Council's terms of reference for appointing the independent commissioners.

## **Greater Wellington's response follows:**

You have requested that your request be treated with urgency and have provided the following reasons "this is a current and ongoing matter with restricted time frames, and the provision of this information is essential so all parties are treated fairly and with no partiality". Greater Wellington has assessed your request for urgency and has processed your request as soon as is reasonably practicable.

1. When was 4Sight Consulting Limited acquired by SLR group?

The date of settlement / completed acquisition of 4Sight was 26 August 2022. This was set out in Minute #10 as published on the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant notified consent application Have Your Say page.

2. Will Commissioner Ashby continue to be Chair of the Panel? If not, then who will be subsequent Chair?

Yes, Commissioner Ashby will continue to be Chair of the Panel;

- 3. Please provide a copy of the legal advice referred to from Greater Wellington Regional Council legal counsel; and
- 4. Please provide a copy of any other legal advice obtained.

5.

In respect to requests 3 and 4, Greater Wellington did not receive legal advice on this matter. We are therefore refusing parts 3 and 4 of your request under section 17(g) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 (the Act) on the basis that the information requested is not held by the Greater Wellington and we have no grounds for believing that the information is held by another local authority or a department of Minister of the Crown or organisation.

On the Have Your Say website it says "Greater Wellington has advised the Applicant's legal counsel of this situation, and the Applicant is comfortable that the potential for conflict can be managed". This means that we advised the Applicant's Legal Counsel of this development to check if the Applicant has concerns with this unforeseen development.

Please provide the decision report that covers how the risk of potential conflict has been/is being managed, and any correspondence and meeting notes subsequent to the decision report. And any other relevant documents.

Greater Wellington has not received any reports on managing potential conflict. We are therefore refusing this part of your request under section 17(g) of the Local Government

Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 (the Act) on the basis that the information requested is not held by the Greater Wellington and we have no grounds for believing that the information is held by another local authority or a department of Minister of the Crown or organisation.

Please refer to **Attachment 1** for relevant correspondence.

6. We note that Council/s have discussed and agreed how to manage the conflict of interest with the applicant. However, it is the submitters who are most at risk of being adversely affected by the conflict. Please advise whether you will be consulting and seeking agreement of submitters

We will not be consulting and seeking agreement from submitters with regards to the decision for Commissioner Ashby to remain as the Chair of the Hearing Panel.

7. Please provide Greater Wellington Regional Council's terms of reference for appointing the independent commissioners

Please see **Attachment 2** for the completed "APPOINTMENT OF COMMISSIONER(S) TO HEAR RESOURCE CONSENT APPLICATIONS ON BEHALF OF WELLINGTON REGIONAL COUNCIL" document specific to the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant resource consent application. Further, please see **Attachment 3** the relevant section of the Greater Wellington delegations Manual.

If you have any concerns with the decision(s) referred to in this letter, you have the right to request an investigation and review by the Ombudsman under section 27(3) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987.

Please note that it is our policy to proactively release our responses to official information requests where possible. Our response to your request will be published shortly on Greater Wellington's website with your personal information removed.

Nāku iti noa, nā

Al Cross Kaiwhakahaere Matua Taiao | General Manager Environment

	From: To: Cc: Subject: Date: Attachments:	Jude Chittock Joshua Knowles; RE: 4Sight / SLR Monday, 29 August 2022 8:54:55 am image001.png image002.png image003.jpg image004.png
	Thanks Team	
	Ngā mihi 	
	Mark Ashby Manager Welling Mobile: <u>4Sight.Consulting</u>	ton, Principal Planning and Policy Consultant
	To: Liz Burge Chittock <jude.c Cc: Nigel Mark-E <joshua.knowles< th=""><th>29 August 2022 8:09 am Mark Ashby hittock@gw.govt.nz&gt; Brown ; Joshua Knowles s@gw.govt.nz&gt;; Michael Lindgreen</th></joshua.knowles<></jude.c 	29 August 2022 8:09 am Mark Ashby hittock@gw.govt.nz> Brown ; Joshua Knowles s@gw.govt.nz>; Michael Lindgreen
	Subject: RE: 4Sig Hi Mark,	SIL / SER
	Thanks for alerti	ng us to this. I agree with Liz.
	Regards Shane	
0	Dr Shane Kelly Ph. Mobile	
		2



This email message and any attachment(s) is intended solely for the addressee(s) named above. The information it contains is confidential and may be legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not peruse, use, disseminate, distribute or copy this email or attachments. Unauthorised use of the message, or the information it contains, may be unlawful. If you have received this message by mistake please call the sender immediately on 09 5366238 or notify us by return email and erase the original message and attachments. Coast and Catchment Ltd. accepts no responsibility for changes made to this email or to any attachments after transmission from its office.

From: Liz Burge	
Sent: Sunday, 28 August 2022 2:	:43 PM
To: Mark Ashby	; Jude Chittock < <u>jude.chittock@gw.govt.nz</u> >
Cc: Nigel Mark-Brown	Shane Kelly
	Joshua Knowles < <u>joshua.knowles@gw.govt.nz</u> >; Michael
Lindgreen	
Subject: RE: 4Sight / SLR	

Kia ora Mark

Thanks for your email - I appreciate you letting us know of your changed work situation.

I agree with the actions that you have detailed in the bullet points **below**; it certainly seems like a sensible and fair way forward to manage this situation and like you indicate the earlier the better to ensure that it is publicised to all parties.

Liz

From: Mark Ashby	
Sent: Friday, 26 August 2022 4:44 p.m.	
To: Jude Chittock < jude.chittock@gw.govt.nz	>
Cc: Liz Burge	; Nigel Mark-Brown
Shane Kelly	Joshua Knowles
<joshua.knowles@gw.govt.nz>; Michael Lind</joshua.knowles@gw.govt.nz>	green
Subject: 4Sight / SLR	

Dear Jude, Josh, and fellow commissioners

Yesterday it was finalised that 4Sight has joined the international SLR consulting group of companies. We are taking the opportunity to inform key contacts, as opposed to you hearing about it from any other source. More communications are likely in due course.

SLR has three offices in NZ, with one of those being in Wellington. Dr Claire Conwell, who has provided expert advice / evidence to the regional council in the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant hearing, is an SLR Wellington team member.

In effect, Dr Conwell and I are now colleagues, although the 4Sight and SLR offices remain physically separate for now.

I was unaware of the potential for this outcome when I took on the role of Commissioner / Chair for the PWWTP hearing. I became aware of it on 22 July but, for obvious commercial reasons, have been unable to let you know until today.

The new circumstances of SLR/4Sight have the potential to be seen as a conflict of interest, in that I could be assumed to favour the evidence of Dr Conwell over that of other persons. I propose the following actions to avoid or minimise the perception of potential bias:

- GWRC to immediately inform the Applicant's legal counsel of the circumstances
- After consulting with the Applicant, GWRC to upload a suitable statement to the application webpage (with wording to be agreed between GWRC, the Applicant and myself)
- In deliberations and decision writing, the panel to ensure that I do not play a
  determinative part in discussions / decision making / writing where the evidence of Dr
  Conwell is a key factor
- The decision report to include a suitable statement that covers the matters outlined above

Jude - thanks for our phone call earlier today about these matters.

Please let me know if you agree with those actions, or if you have other suggestions. With the news now out in the public domain, it is important that the Council and panel's management of the issue is settled and appropriately publicised.

Ngā mihi

# Mark Ashby

Manager Wellington (Poneke) Principal Planning and Policy Consultant

Mobile:

Company Name

# 4SIGHT COVID-19 RESPONSE PLAN

Level 6, Aviation House 12 Johnston Street PO Box 25356, Featherston Street, Wellington 6146 <u>Asight.Consulting</u><u>LinkedIn</u>

NOTICE - This e-mail is only intended to be read by the named recipient. It may contain information which is confidential, proprietary or the subject of legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail. If you are not the intended recipient you should not copy this e-mail or use the information contained in it for any purpose nor disclose its contents to any other person. Legal privilege is not waived because you have read this e-mail. 4Sight Consulting accepts no responsibility for electronic viruses or damage caused as a result of this email or for changes made to this email or to any attachments after transmission from 4Sight Consulting. You should not distribute or publish the contents of this email or any attachment without the prior consent of 4Sight



Consulting.

From:	Shaun Andrewartha
То:	Jude Chittock
Subject:	RE: 4Sight / SLR: draft webpage statement for review
Date:	Tuesday, 30 August 2022 12:11:04 pm
Attachments:	image001.png
	image002.png

Looks good to me. Well managed!

From: Jude Chittock <Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz>
Sent: Tuesday, 30 August 2022 9:26 am
To: Shaun Andrewartha <Shaun.Andrewartha@gw.govt.nz>
Subject: FW: 4Sight / SLR: draft webpage statement for review

Hi Shaun Are you happy with this statement?

I am just checking the scope of Claires expertise in this consent is covered by what Mark has said below... Otherwise im happy and agree with the proposed approach

Cheers Jude

From: Mark Ashby

Sent: Monday, 29 August 2022 5:56 pm

To: Jude Chittock <<u>Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz</u>>

Cc: Shane Kelly

Nigel Mark-Brown

Subject: 4Sight / SLR: draft webpage statement for review

; Elizabeth Burge

Hi Jude

This is a draft proposed statement for the webpage:

"Commissioner Ashby has identified a situation which could be seen as a conflict of interest. His employer, 4Sight Consulting Limited, has been acquired by another consultancy – SLR Group. The SLR Group is the employer of Dr Claire Conwell, who is Greater Wellington's expert adviser on marine water quality for the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant (PWWTP) consent process. In effect, Commissioner Ashby and Dr Conwell are now colleagues, although they do not share the same physical office. Commissioner Ashby was not aware of the impending sale of 4Sight until after the in-person PWWTP hearing.

Greater Wellington has advised the Applicant's legal counsel of this situation, and the Applicant is comfortable that the potential for conflict can be managed. To that end, Commissioner Ashby (and the panel) have proposed the following actions to avoid any risk that his decision making could be seen to favour the evidence of Dr Conwell over that of other persons:

In deliberations and decision writing, the panel will ensure that Commissioner Ashby does not play a determinative part in discussions / decision making / writing where the evidence of Dr Conwell is a key factor.

• The decision report will include a statement that covers how the risk of potential conflict has been managed.

The approach to conflict management, and the above statement, has been discussed and agreed with the Applicant."

Ngā mihi

## Mark Ashby

Manager Wellington (Pōneke) Principal Planning and Policy Consultant

Mobile:		
Company	Name	
	?	

# **4SIGHT COVID-19 RESPONSE PLAN**

Level 6, Aviation House 12 Johnston Street PO Box 25356, Featherston Street, Wellington 6146 <u>ASight.Consulting</u> LinkedIn



NOTICE - This e-mail is only intended to be read by the named recipient. It may contain information which is confidential, proprietary or the subject of legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail. If you are not the intended recipient you should not copy this e-mail or use the information contained in it for any purpose nor disclose its contents to any other person. Legal privilege is not waived because you have read this e-mail. 4Sight Consulting accepts no responsibility for electronic viruses or damage caused as a result of this email or for changes made to this email or to any attachments after transmission from 4Sight Consulting. You should not distribute or publish the contents of this email or any attachment without the prior consent of 4Sight Consulting.

From:	
То:	; Jude Chittock
Cc:	; <u>Joshua Knowles</u>
Subject:	RE: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS- KSNational.FID408944]
Date:	Wednesday, 31 August 2022 12:46:10 pm
Attachments:	image001.png image002.png image003.jpg image004.jpg image005.png

That seems sensible to me - it will be well covered off then.

Liz

From: Mark Ashby

Sent: Wednesday, 31 August 2022 12:44 p.m.

 To: Shane Kelly
 Jude Chittock <Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz>

 Cc: Elizabeth Burge
 Joshua

Knowles <Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz>

**Subject:** RE: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS-KSNational.FID408944]

Thanks Shane

l agree.

Perhaps it would be a good thing to include in the statement, regardless of the fact that it won't physically possible for either of us to directly access each other's relevant folders until next year.

Ngā mihi

# Mark Ashby

Manager Wellington, Principal Planning and Policy Consultant

Mobile: 4Sight.Consulting

From: Shane Kelly

Sent: Wednesday, 31 August 2022 12:29 pm

**To:** Mark Ashby ; Jude Chittock <<u>Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz</u>>

Joshua

Cc: Elizabeth Burge

Knowles <<u>Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz</u>>

?

**Subject:** RE: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS-KSNational.FID408944]

### Hi Mark.

I'm happy with the suggested amendment - noting that you also don't see a problem with locking folders if it is necessary.

Cheers	
Shane	
Dr Shane Kelly Ph. Mobile	
2	
?	

This email message and any attachment(s) is intended solely for the addressee(s) named above. The information it contains is confidential and may be legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not peruse, use, disseminate, distribute or copy this email or attachments. Unauthorised use of the message, or the information it contains, may be unlawful. If you have received this message by mistake please call the sender immediately on 09 5366238 or notify us by return email and erase the original message and attachments. Coast and Catchment Ltd. accepts no responsibility for changes made to this email or to any attachments after transmission from its office.

From: Mark Ashby Sent: Wednesday, 31 August 2022 12:17 PM To: Jude Chittock < Jude. Chittock@gw.govt.nz> Cc: Shane Kelly ; Elizabeth Burge Joshua Knowles

### <Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz>

Subject: RE: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS-KSNational.FID408944]

Hi everybody

I foresee no risk in that regard.

SLR and 4Sight project folders will not be integrated and visible across the company until approximately end of Q1 next year. So there is no particular need to lock folders, although it can certainly be easily done.

	-		•	
N	gā	m	Ш	hı
	БЧ			

# Mark Ashby

Manager Wellington, Principal Planning and Policy Consultant

4Sight.Consulting	
?	G
From: Jude Chittock < <u>Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz</u> >	
Sent: Wednesday, 31 August 2022 10:06 am	
To: Mark Ashby	
Cc: Shane Kelly	; Elizabeth Burge
	Joshua Knowles
< <u>Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz</u> >	
Subject: FW: WGN200229: Draft statement for we	bpage - potential conflict of interest re

hearing commissioner [KS-KSNational.FID408944]

Hi Mark

The applicant has come back to us (see email below). Is it possible to put information barriers in place when SLR and 4Sight start sharing systems? Or will they remain separate?

I spoke to Tim Baker at SLR earlier this week, and he said it is still early stages but agreed there would be ways to lock access to Claires files for example if needed.

Can you please confirm if you agree to the updated statement wording?

Thanks Jude

From: Hudspith, Ezekiel
Sent: Wednesday, 31 August 2022 9:30 am
To: Jude Chittock <<u>Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz</u>>
Subject: FW: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS-KSNational.FID408944]

## Hi Jude

Thanks for this, and your call the other day. I've now received feedback on this from Wellington Water and they are also comfortable in the circumstances. Can we just add something about information barriers (or equivalent measures) as mentioned over the phone (suggested text highlighted below); it is how we would handle it as lawyers if involved for more than one party in something. Let me know if that is problematic/not straightforward. If they don't even have access to the same systems then it could simply record that instead.

Kind regards,

Zeke 2 Ezekiel Hudspith Partner My pronouns are: He/Him/His What's Next? The answer is Talent. With more than 20.000 people, 12,000 lawyers and 200 locations, Dentons has the talent for what you need, where you need it. D Μ Bio Website Dentons Kensington Swan 89 The Terrace, Wellington, 6011, New Zealand LuatViet > Fernanda Lopes & Associados > Guevara & Gutierrez > Paz Horowitz Abogados > Sirote > Adepetun Caxton-Martins Agbor & Segun > Davis Brown > East African Law Chambers > Eric Silwamba, Jalasi and Linyama > Durham Jones & Pinegar > LEAD Advogados > For more information on the firms that have come together to form Dentons, go to dentons.com/legacyfirms Dentons is a global legal practice providing client services worldwide through its member firms and affiliates. This email may be confidential and protected by legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient, disclosure, copying, distribution and use are prohibited; please notify us immediately and delete this email from your systems. Dentons records and stores emails sent to us or our affiliates in keeping with our internal policies and procedures. Dentons Kensington Swan is a partnership governed by New Zealand law. Please see dentons.com for Legal Notices.

From: Jude Chittock <<u>Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz</u>>
Sent: Tuesday, 30 August 2022 11:21 a.m.
To: Hudspith, Ezekie
Cc: Shaun Andrewartha <<u>Shaun.Andrewartha@gw.govt.nz</u>>; Joshua Knowles
<<u>Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz</u>>
Subject: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage

# [WARNING: EXTERNAL SENDER]

Hi Zeke

As discussed yesterday, please see the draft statement below outlining the situation and proposed approach. Please discuss this issue with the applicant and let me know if they agree with the approach and statement wording.

Thanks Jude

This is a draft proposed statement for the webpage:

.....

"Commissioner Ashby has identified a situation which could be seen as a conflict of interest. His employer, 4Sight Consulting Limited, has been acquired by another consultancy – SLR Group. The SLR Group is the employer of Dr Claire Conwell, who is Greater Wellington's expert adviser on coastal water quality and marine ecology for the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant (PWWTP) consent process. In effect, Commissioner Ashby and Dr Conwell are now colleagues, although they do not share the same physical office. Commissioner Ashby was not aware of the impending sale of 4Sight until after the in-person PWWTP hearing.

Greater Wellington has advised the Applicant's legal counsel of this situation, and the Applicant is comfortable that the potential for conflict can be managed. To that end, Commissioner Ashby (and the panel) have proposed the following actions to avoid any risk that his decision making could be seen to favour the evidence of Dr Conwell over that of other persons:

- In deliberations and decision writing, the panel will ensure that Commissioner Ashby does not play a determinative part in discussions / decision making / writing where the evidence of Dr Conwell is a key factor.
- The decision report will include a statement that covers how the risk of potential conflict has been managed.
- Commissioner Ashby will ensure that (if necessary) an information barrier is set up on any shared computer system, so that Commissioner Ashby and Dr Conwell could not access each other's documents concerning this application.

The approach to conflict management, and the above statement, has been discussed and agreed with the Applicant."

Ngā mihi Jude

makaurangi

### Jude Chittock

Kaitaki-a-tīma | Team Leader, Consents and Compliance Greater Wellington Te Pane Matua Taiao 021 195 5689 100 Cuba St, Te Aro, Wellington 6011 Follow us online: Facebook | Twitter\_| gw.govt.nz

ATTENTION: This correspondence is confidential and intended for the named recipient(s) only. If you are not the named recipient and receive this correspondence in error, you must not copy, distribute or take any action in reliance on it and you should delete it from your system and notify the sender immediately. Unless otherwise stated, any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author, and do not represent those of the organisation.

ATTENTION: This correspondence is confidential and intended for the named recipient(s) only. If you are not the named recipient and receive this correspondence in error, you must not copy, distribute or take any action in reliance on it and you should delete it from your system and

notify the sender immediately. Unless otherwise stated, any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author, and do not represent those of the organisation.

 
 From:
 Jude Chittock; Joshua Knowles

 To:
 Jude Chittock; Joshua Knowles

 Subject:
 can you please remove the notice from the website??

 Date:
 Wednesday, 31 August 2022 2:30:28 pm

 Attachments:
 image001.png image002.png

 Importance:
 High

Hi Jude / Josh

Can you pleas remove the conflict notice from the website, until later this week.

Ngā mihi

## Mark Ashby

Manager Wellington (Pōneke) Principal Planning and Policy Consultant

Mobile: Company Name

# **4SIGHT COVID-19 RESPONSE PLAN**

Level 6, Aviation House 12 Johnston Street PO Box 25356, Featherston Street, Wellington 6146 <u>ASight.Consulting</u> LinkedIn



NOTICE - This e-mail is only intended to be read by the named recipient. It may contain information which is confidential, proprietary or the subject of legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail. If you are not the intended recipient you should not copy this e-mail or use the information contained in it for any purpose nor disclose its contents to any other person. Legal privilege is not waived because you have read this e-mail. 4Sight Consulting accepts no responsibility for electronic viruses or damage caused as a result of this email or for changes made to this email or to any attachments after transmission from 4Sight Consulting. You should not distribute or publish the contents of this email or any attachment without the prior consent of 4Sight Consulting.

From:	Jude Chittock
То:	
Cc:	Michelle Conland
Subject:	FW: Update to Have Your Say Page
Date:	Wednesday, 31 August 2022 2:09:00 pm
Attachments:	image001.png

Hi Tim

As discussed yesterday, a statement has been prepared and uploaded to our website outlining the situation with SLR/4Sight and how this will be managed to ensure Commissioner Ashby can remain independent.

Let me know if you have any questions or comments

Thanks Jude

From: Joshua Knowles <Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz>
Sent: Wednesday, 31 August 2022 2:06 pm
Subject: Update to Have Your Say Page

Kia ora,

Please be aware that a new action '**4Sight Consulting Limited acquired by SLR Group'** has been added to the 'Recent Actions' table on the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant notified consent application Have Your Say Page.

Find more details here https://haveyoursay.gw.govt.nz/poriruawwtp

Ngā mihi



Josh Knowles (he/ him) Kaitohutohu / Resource Advisor Greater Wellington Te Pane Matua Taiao Mobile: 021 346778 100 Cuba Street, Te Aro, Wellington 6011 Follow us online: Facebook | Twitter | gw.govt.nz

From: To:	Jude Chittock
Cc:	Michelle Conland
Subject:	Re: Update to Have Your Say Page
Date:	Wednesday, 31 August 2022 2:25:25 pm
Attachments:	image001.png
	image001.png
	image978447.png
	image796555.png
	image672206.png
	image029230.png
	image669178.png
	image851395.png
	image861784.png

## Hi Jude

The acquisition has not been publicly announced yet, would it be possible to removed the statement until next Tuesday please?

Thanks Tim

## Sent from my iPhone



Tim Baker Principal Consultant - Water Resources Wellington Office Manager



SLR Consulting NZ Limited 12A Waterloo Quay, Wellington, New Zealand, 6011

This communication, and any attachment(s) contains information which is confidential and may also be legally privileged. It is intended for the exclusive use of the recipient(s) to whom it is addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, any disclosure, copying, distribution or action

Any advice or opinion is provided on the basis that it has been prepared by SLR with reasonable skill, care and diligence, taking account of the manpower, timescales and resources devoted to it by agreement with its Client. It is subject to the terms and conditions of any appointment to which it relates. Parties with whom SLR is not in a contractual relationship in relation to the subject of the message should not use or place On 31/08/2022, at 14:09, Jude Chittock <jude.chittock@gw.govt.nz> wrote:

### Hi Tim

As discussed yesterday, a statement has been prepared and uploaded to our website outlining the situation with SLR/4Sight and how this will be managed to ensure Commissioner Ashby can remain independent.

Let me know if you have any questions or comments

Thanks Jude

From: Joshua Knowles <Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz>
Sent: Wednesday, 31 August 2022 2:06 pm
Subject: Update to Have Your Say Page

Kia ora,

Please be aware that a new action '**4Sight Consulting Limited acquired by SLR Group'** has been added to the 'Recent Actions' table on the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant notified consent application Have Your Say Page.

Find more details here https://haveyoursay.gw.govt.nz/poriruawwtp

Ngā mihi

# image001.png

Josh Knowles (he/ him) Kaitohutohu / Resource Advisor Greater Wellington Te Pane Matua Taiao Mobile: 021 346778 100 Cuba Street, Te Aro, Wellington 6011 Follow us online: Facebook | Twitter | gw.govt.nz

ATTENTION: This correspondence is confidential and intended for the named recipient(s) only. If you are not the named recipient and receive this correspondence in error, you must not copy, distribute or take any action in reliance on it and you should delete it from your system and notify the sender immediately. Unless otherwise stated, any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author, and do not represent those of the organisation.

From: To: Cc: Subject:

Date: Attachments: Jude Chittock Joshua Knowles Re: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS-KSNational.FID408944] Wednesday, 31 August 2022 2:35:13 pm image002.png image003.png

Sounds fine to me

Regards

Nigel

On 31/08/2022 12:17 pm, Mark Ashby wrote:

Hi everybody

I foresee no risk in that regard.

SLR and 4Sight project folders will not be integrated and visible across the company until approximately end of Q1 next year. So there is no particular need to lock folders, although it can certainly be easily done.

Ngā mihi

## Mark Ashby

Manager Wellington, Principal Planning and Policy Consultant

Mobile: <u>4Sight.Consulting</u>





**Subject:** FW: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS-KSNational.FID408944]

Hi Mark

The applicant has come back to us (see email below). Is it possible to put information barriers in place when SLR and 4Sight start sharing systems? Or will

they remain separate?

I spoke to Tim Baker at SLR earlier this week, and he said it is still early stages but agreed there would be ways to lock access to Claires files for example if needed.

Can you please confirm if you agree to the updated statement wording?

Thanks Jude

From: Hudspith, Ezekiel

Sent: Wednesday, 31 August 2022 9:30 am

To: Jude Chittock <<u>Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz</u>>

**Subject:** FW: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS-KSNational.FID408944]

Hi Jude

Thanks for this, and your call the other day. I've now received feedback on this from Wellington Water and they are also comfortable in the circumstances. Can we just add something about information barriers (or equivalent measures) as mentioned over the phone (suggested text highlighted below); it is how we would handle it as lawyers if involved for more than one party in something. Let me know if that is problematic/not straightforward. If they don't even have access to the same systems then it could simply record that instead.

Kind regards, Zeke

> Ezekiel Hudspith Partner

My pronouns are: He/Him/His

What's Next? The answer is Talent. With more than 20,000 people, 12,000 lawyers and 200 locations, Dentons has the talent for what you need, where you need it.



Dentons Kensington Swan 89 The Terrace, Wellington, 6011, New Zealand

LuatViet > Fernanda Lopes & Associados > Guevara & Gutierrez > Paz Horowitz Abogados > Sirote > Adepetun Caxton-Martins Agbor & Segun > Davis Brown > East African Law Chambers > Eric Silwamba, Jalasi and Linyama > Durham Jones & Pinegar > LEAD Advogados > For more information on the firms that have come together to form

### Dentons, go to dentons.com/legacyfirms

Dentons is a global legal practice providing client services worldwide through its member firms and affiliates. This email may be confidential and protected by legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient, disclosure, copying, distribution and use are prohibited; please notify us immediately and delete this email from your systems. Dentons records and stores emails sent to us or our affiliates in keeping with our internal policies and procedures. Dentons Kensington Swan is a partnership governed by New Zealand law. Please see dentons.com for Legal Notices.

From: Jude Chittock <<u>Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz</u>>
Sent: Tuesday, 30 August 2022 11:21 a.m.
To: Hudspith, Ezekiel
Cc: Shaun Andrewartha <<u>Shaun.Andrewartha@gw.govt.nz</u>>; Joshua Knowles
<<u>Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz</u>>
Subject: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage

#### [WARNING: EXTERNAL SENDER]

Hi Zeke

As discussed yesterday, please see the draft statement below outlining the situation and proposed approach. Please discuss this issue with the applicant and let me know if they agree with the approach and statement wording.

Thanks Jude

This is a draft proposed statement for the webpage:



"Commissioner Ashby has identified a situation which could be seen as a conflict of interest. His employer, 4Sight Consulting Limited, has been acquired by another consultancy – SLR Group. The SLR Group is the employer of Dr Claire Conwell, who is Greater Wellington's expert adviser on coastal water quality and marine ecology for the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant (PWWTP) consent process. In effect, Commissioner Ashby and Dr Conwell are now colleagues, although they do not share the same physical office. Commissioner Ashby was not aware of the impending sale of 4Sight until after the in-person PWWTP hearing.

Greater Wellington has advised the Applicant's legal counsel of this situation, and the Applicant is comfortable that the potential for conflict can be managed. To that end, Commissioner Ashby (and the panel) have proposed the following actions to avoid any risk that his decision making could be seen to favour the evidence of Dr Conwell over that of other persons:

- In deliberations and decision writing, the panel will ensure that Commissioner Ashby does not play a determinative part in discussions / decision making / writing where the evidence of Dr Conwell is a key factor.
- <!--[if !supportLists]-->• <!--[endif]-->The decision report will include a statement that covers how the risk of potential conflict has been managed.
- Commissioner Ashby will ensure that (if necessary) an information barrier is set up on any shared computer system, so that Commissioner Ashby and Dr Conwell could not access each other's documents concerning this application.

The approach to conflict management, and the above statement, has been discussed and agreed with the Applicant."

# Ngā mihi



### Jude Chittock

Kaitaki-a-tīma | Team Leader, Consents and Compliance Greater Wellington Te Pane Matua Taiao 021 195 5689 100 Cuba St, Te Aro, Wellington 6011 Follow us online: Facebook | Twitter | gw.govt.nz

ATTENTION: This correspondence is confidential and intended for the named recipient(s) only. If you are not the named recipient and receive this correspondence in error, you must not copy, distribute or take any action in reliance on it and you should delete it from your system and notify the sender immediately. Unless otherwise stated, any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author, and do not represent those of the organisation. ATTENTION: This correspondence is confidential and intended for the named recipient(s) only. If you are not the named recipient and receive this correspondence in error, you must not copy, distribute or take any action in reliance on it and you should delete it from your system and notify the sender immediately. Unless otherwise stated, any views or opinions expressed are solely those of it and you should delete it from your system and notify the sender immediately. Unless otherwise stated, any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author, and do not represent those of the organisation.

Environmental Context Ltd <u>www.envirocontext.co.nz</u> PO Box 147 424 Auckland 1144 ph: mobile:

From: Bcc:	Joshua Knowles	I
		Jude Chittock;
Subject:	Update to Have Your Say Page	
Date:	Wednesday, 31 August 2022 2:05:00 pm	
Attachments:	image001.png	

Kia ora,

Please be aware that a new action '**4Sight Consulting Limited acquired by SLR Group'** has been added to the 'Recent Actions' table on the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant notified consent application Have Your Say Page.

Find more details here https://haveyoursay.gw.govt.nz/poriruawwtp

Ngā mihi



Josh Knowles (he/ him) Kaitohutohu / Resource Advisor Greater Wellington Te Pane Matua Taiao Mobile: 021 346778 100 Cuba Street, Te Aro, Wellington 6011 Follow us online: <u>Facebook</u> | <u>Twitter</u> | <u>gw.govt.nz</u>

From:	Jude Chittock	
То:		
Subject:	RE: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS- KSNational.FID408944]	
Date:	Wednesday, 31 August 2022 9:57:00 am	
Attachments:	image001.png	

Hi Zeke

Good point thank you for adding that in. I spoke to Tim Baker at SLR about this and he said they are a way off having access to each others filing systems (and will be in separate offices for a while) but he agreed to ensure barriers are put in place to prevent Commissioner Ashby and Dr Conwells work on this consent being visible to each other.

Ill confirm the new statement wording with the hearing panel and let you know before it goes live.

Cheers Jude

From: Hudspith, Ezekiel <ezekiel.hudspith@dentons.com>
Sent: Wednesday, 31 August 2022 9:30 am
To: Jude Chittock <Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz>
Subject: FW: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage - potential conflict of interest re hearing commissioner [KS-KSNational.FID408944]

Hi Jude

Thanks for this, and your call the other day. I've now received feedback on this from Wellington Water and they are also comfortable in the circumstances. Can we just add something about information barriers (or equivalent measures) as mentioned over the phone (suggested text highlighted below); it is how we would handle it as lawyers if involved for more than one party in something. Let me know if that is problematic/not straightforward. If they don't even have access to the same systems then it could simply record that instead.

Kind regards, Zeke



Ezekiel Hudspith

My pronouns are: He/Him/His

What's Next? The answer is Talent. With more than 20,000 people, 12,000 lawyers and 200 locations, Dentons has the talent for what you need, where you need it.

M Bio Website

Dentons Kensington Swan 89 The Terrace, Wellington, 6011, New Zealand LuatViet > Fernanda Lopes & Associados > Guevara & Gutierrez > Paz Horowitz Abogados > Sirote > Adepetun Caxton-Martins Agbor & Segun > Davis Brown > East African Law Chambers > Eric Silwamba, Jalasi and Linyama > Durham Jones & Pinegar > LEAD Advogados > For more information on the firms that have come together to form Dentons, go to dentons.com/legacyfirms

Dentons is a global legal practice providing client services worldwide through its member firms and affiliates. This email may be confidential and protected by legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient, disclosure, copying, distribution and use are prohibited; please notify us immediately and delete this email from your systems. Dentons records and stores emails sent to us or our affiliates in keeping with our internal policies and procedures. Dentons Kensington Swan is a partnership governed by New Zealand law. Please see dentons.com for Legal Notices.

From: Jude Chittock <Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz>
Sent: Tuesday, 30 August 2022 11:21 a.m.
To: Hudspith, Ezekiel
Cc: Shaun Andrewartha <Shaun.Andrewartha@gw.govt.nz>; Joshua Knowles
<Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz>
Subject: WGN200229: Draft statement for webpage

### [WARNING: EXTERNAL SENDER]

Hi Zeke

As discussed yesterday, please see the draft statement below outlining the situation and proposed approach. Please discuss this issue with the applicant and let me know if they agree with the approach and statement wording.

Thanks Jude

This is a draft proposed statement for the webpage:

### .....

"Commissioner Ashby has identified a situation which could be seen as a conflict of interest. His employer, 4Sight Consulting Limited, has been acquired by another consultancy – SLR Group. The SLR Group is the employer of Dr Claire Conwell, who is Greater Wellington's expert adviser on coastal water quality and marine ecology for the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant (PWWTP) consent process. In effect, Commissioner Ashby and Dr Conwell are now colleagues, although they do not share the same physical office. Commissioner Ashby was not aware of the impending sale of 4Sight until after the in-person PWWTP hearing.

Greater Wellington has advised the Applicant's legal counsel of this situation, and the Applicant is comfortable that the potential for conflict can be managed. To that end, Commissioner Ashby (and the panel) have proposed the following actions to avoid any risk that his decision making could be seen to favour the evidence of Dr Conwell over that of other persons:

- In deliberations and decision writing, the panel will ensure that Commissioner Ashby does not play a determinative part in discussions / decision making / writing where the evidence of Dr Conwell is a key factor.
- The decision report will include a statement that covers how the risk of potential conflict has been managed.
- Commissioner Ashby will ensure that (if necessary) an information barrier is set up on any shared computer system, so that Commissioner Ashby and Dr Conwell could not access each other's documents concerning this application.

The approach to conflict management, and the above statement, has been discussed and agreed with the Applicant."



ATTENTION: This correspondence is confidential and intended for the named recipient(s) only. If you are not the named recipient and receive this correspondence in error, you must not copy, distribute or take any action in reliance on it and you should delete it from your system and notify the sender immediately. Unless otherwise stated, any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author, and do not represent those of the organisation.

From:	
To:	Joshua Knowles; Jude Chittock
Subject:	RE: SLR statement
Date:	Thursday, 1 September 2022 9:27:00 am
Attachments:	image001.png
	image002.png
	image003.png

Josh – not your problem at all.

Totally on my head but all good at the end of the day.

Ngā mihi

# Mark Ashby

Manager Wellington, Principal Planning and Policy Consultant Mobile: 45 Mobil

?

From: Joshua Knowles <Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz>
Sent: Thursday, 1 September 2022 9:23 am
To: Mark Ashby
Subject: RE: SLR statement

Thanks Mark,

Sorry for the mix up there.

Ngā mihi

makaurangi

2

Josh Knowles (he/ him) Kaitohutohu / Resource Advisor Greater Wellington Te Pane Matua Taiao Mobile: 021 346778 100 Cuba Street, Te Aro, Wellington 6011 Follow us online: Facebook | Twitter. | gw.govt.nz Sent: Thursday, 1 September 2022 8:53 am

To: Jude Chittock <<u>Jude.Chittock@gw.govt.nz</u>>; Joshua Knowles <<u>Joshua.Knowles@gw.govt.nz</u>> Subject: SLR statement

Hi there

No need for any further action on this. We are happy to let it stand as is.

Ngā mihi

# Mark Ashby

Manager Wellington (Pōneke) Principal Planning and Policy Consultant



# **4SIGHT COVID-19 RESPONSE PLAN**

Level 6, Aviation House 12 Johnston Street PO Box 25356, Featherston Street, Wellington 6146 <u>ASight.Consulting</u> LinkedIn



NOTICE - This e-mail is only intended to be read by the named recipient. It may contain information which is confidential, proprietary or the subject of legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail. If you are not the intended recipient you should not copy this e-mail or use the information contained in it for any purpose nor disclose its contents to any other person. Legal privilege is not waived because you have read this e-mail. 4Sight Consulting accepts no responsibility for electronic viruses or damage caused as a result of this email or for changes made to this email or to any attachments after transmission from 4Sight Consulting. You should not distribute or publish the contents of this email or any attachment without the prior consent of 4Sight Consulting.

ATTENTION: This correspondence is confidential and intended for the named

recipient(s) only. If you are not the named recipient and receive this correspondence in error, you must not copy, distribute or take any action in reliance on it and you should delete it from your system and notify the sender immediately. Unless otherwise stated, any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author, and do not represent those of the organisation.



12 April 2022 File WGN200229

# APPOINTMENT OF COMMISSIONER(S) TO HEAR RESOURCE CONSENT APPLICATIONS ON BEHALF OF WELLINGTON REGIONAL COUNCIL

## Application to the Wellington Regional Council: WGN200229 [36816] and [36727]

Pursuant to section 34A of the Resource Management Act 1991 (the Act), the General Manager, Environment Management under authority delegated by the Wellington Regional Council, and in consultation with the Chair of the Environment Committee and Council Chair, appoints the following Commissioner(s) in relation to the discharge of contaminants to the coastal marine area and to air associated with the operation of the Porirua Wastewater Treatment Plant:

Independent Commissioner - Mark Ashby (Chair) Independent Commissioner – Elizabeth Burge Independent Commissioner – Dr Shane Kelly Independent Commissioner – Nigel Mark Brown

In the unlikely case of a split decision the Chair has the casting vote.

General Manager, Environment Management Greater Wellington Regional Council

Date: 12 April 2022

## Delegation

Council has delegated the following powers to a commissioner or panel of commissioners appointed to determine a particular matter:

All of the powers, functions and duties of the Council under the Resource Management Act 1991 (the Act) to:

- Hear, consider and make decisions on any application for a resource consent under the Act, including the determination of any preliminary matters and matters necessary for the conduct of the hearing
- Hear and determine a review of a resource consent
- Hear and determine an application to change or cancel conditions of a consent
- Hear and determine an objection made under the Act
- Hear and determine coastal activity applications.

Explanatory note: The above delegations encompass the following:

- Directions to provide evidence within time limits under section 41B
- Directions and requests before or at hearings under section 41C
- Strike out submissions under section 41D
- Defer the notification or hearing of an application for resource consent (section 91)
- Decide whether to publicly or limited notify an application for resource consent or change or cancellation of conditions (sections 95, 95A, 95B, 95D, 95F, 95G, and 127)
- Arrange pre-hearing meetings and decide whether to decline to process a person's application or consider a person's submission if they fail to attend a pre-hearing meeting (section 99)
- Refer an applicant for resource consent to mediation (section 99A)
- Conduct a mediation (section 99A)
- Determine that a hearing of an application is necessary (section 100)
- Hear and decide a notified or non-notified application for resource consent, change of conditions, cancellation of consent including anything required for the purpose of processing the application and conducting the hearing (sections 104 to 108AA)
- Fix a commencement date and time, and the place, of a hearing (section 101)
- Determine that applications to two or more consent authorities for the same proposal are sufficiently unrelated that a joint hearing is unnecessary (section 102)
- Determine that applications for resource consents for the same proposal are sufficiently unrelated so that it is unnecessary for GWRC to hear the applications together (section 103)
- Decline an application for a resource consent on the grounds that it has inadequate information to decide the application (section 104(6))
- Determine a restricted coastal activity and determine conditions (section 117(1))
- Determine an application for extension of the lapse date of a consent (section 125)
- Make decisions on a review of resource consent conditions (section 132)
- Approve the transfer of a water permit in whole or in part to another person on another site or to another site (section 136)
- Approve the transfer of a discharge permit in whole or in part to another site and to any person (section 137)
- Determine a request for a certificate of compliance (section 139)
- Determine a request for an existing use certificate (section 139A)
- Hear and determine an objection made under sections 357, 357A and 357B.

# 11. Delegation to commissioners appointed by the Chief Executive or General Manager Environment Management

On 24 May 2017 (see Report 17.77) the Council delegated the following powers to a commissioner or panel of commissioners appointed by either the Chief Executive or the General Manager Environment Management to determine a particular matter, all of the powers, functions and duties of the Council under the Resource Management Act to:

- Hear, consider and make decisions on any application for a resource consent under the Act, including the determination of any preliminary matters and matters necessary for the conduct of the hearing.
- Hear and determine a review of a resource consent.
- Hear and determine an application to change or cancel conditions of a consent.
- Hear and determine an objection made under the Act.
- Hear and determine coastal activity applications.

# **Explanatory note**: The above delegations encompass the following:

- Directions to provide evidence within time limits under section 41B
- Directions and requests before or at hearings under section 41C
- Strike out submissions under section 41D
- Defer the notification or hearing of an application for resource consent (section 91).
- Decide whether to publicly or limited notify an application for resource consent or change or cancellation of conditions (sections 95, 95A, 95B, 95D, 95F, 95G, 127)
- Arrange pre-hearing meetings and decide whether to decline to process a person's application or consider a person's submission if they fail to attend a pre-hearing meeting (section 99)
- Refer an applicant for resource consent to mediation (section 99A)
- Conduct a mediation (section 99A)
- Determine that a hearing of an application is necessary (section 100)
- Hear and decide a notified or non-notified application for resource consent, change of conditions, cancellation of consent including anything required for the purpose of processing the application and conducting the hearing (sections 104 to 108AA)
- Fix a commencement date and time, and the place, of a hearing (section 101)
- Determine that applications to two or more consent authorities for the same proposal are sufficiently unrelated that a joint hearing is unnecessary (section 102)
- Determine that applications for resource consents for the same proposal are sufficiently unrelated so that it is unnecessary for GWRC to hear the applications together (section 103)
- Decline an application for a resource consent on the grounds that it has inadequate information to decide the application (section 104(6))
- Determine a restricted coastal activity and determine conditions (section 117(1))
- Determine an application for extension of the lapse date of a consent (section 125)
- Make decisions on a review of resource consent conditions (section 132)
- Approve the transfer of a water permit in whole or in part to another person on another site or to another site (section 136)
- Approve the transfer of a discharge permit in whole or in part to another site and to any person (section 137)
- Determine a request for a certificate of compliance (section 139)
- Determine a request for an existing use certificate (section 139A)
- Hear and determine an objection made under sections 357, 357A and 357B.